CHAPTER 5

Conclusion and Recommendations

Based on the data collected from 160 respondents and the results gathered from both a statistical standpoint and an experimental standpoint from the previous chapter, this chapter will present a conclusion to the research. Furthermore, this chapter elaborates the managerial consequences, the research's limitations, and its suggestions from a business standpoint.

5.1 Research Findings

RQ1: Does musical congruity in e-commerce advertisement influence the ad recall?

The mean differences are too slight to conclude that there are major impacts from the musical congruity towards Ad Recall. When it comes to the comparisons of this current research and the previous journal, there are elements and variables that create a difference or abstractness to the result and outcomes of the ad recall element. In fact, the utilization of the musical congruity is applied in two different aspects. The previous research directly applied the Ad Recall variable towards their research that was formed and targeted towards restaurant advertising with the utilization of ethnic music from different countries to best fit the personality of the restaurant. Meanwhile, this research conducted the impacts of musical congruity towards Ad Recall in a perspective of Shopee as an e-commerce. This creates a big difference as the abstractness of the audience, perception towards Shopee, presence of Shopee in the eyes of the public may already create a bias towards the opinions of the respondents towards the Ad Recall variable. Taking into account that the previous research was conducted face to face and one by one towards the respondents while this research was conducted by the utilization of online surveys. Another factor that may affect this is the fact that all the Shopee advertisements were also delivered through a visual video which was not a factor of research in this study, there might be a possibility that the recall aspect was due to the fact that Shopee would primarily use video as the main capturing aspect of their advertisements by the utilization of Cristiano Ronaldo in this Baby Shark based advertisement. This is supported by a finding that over 95% of B2B clients prefer the presence of visual advertising that are short and mobile optimized as the attention span of advertisement viewers have shorten significantly than the older text, informational based era (Taylor, 2014).

RQ2: Does musical congruity in e-commerce advertisement influence the ad attitude?
There are also similar impacts from the Ad Attitude variable when compared towards the Ad Recall variable. Both the variables have a mean value of being slightly different from one to another. The significance and p value of the variable is also exceeding the 0.05 amount. What can be gathered from this is the fact that Shopee’s Ad Attitude also has a sense of bias towards the respondents. As mentioned on the first chapter, the presence of e-commerce and Shopee itself as an online platform has been established with a sense of reliability and exposure where both the public and the respondents that were used in this research already own a pre-assumed idea of what Shopee is as a brand. As mentioned by (Berger and Fitzsimons, 2008) brand exposure may come from advertising exposure where the exposure aspect comes from the ad frequency and effectiveness of the advertisement, or even incidental exposure where the exposure aspect may come from environmental exposures such as the presence of a brand, in this case Shopee. When this presumption of Shopee as a brand clash with the variable of Ad Attitude through the questions distributed, respondents may already have an idea of what the brand is, resulting in their answer having a possibility where it might contain their idea of the platform from incidental exposure, affecting the answer they chose from the questionnaire. In comparison with the previous research, the respondents' opinions are towards a singular type of restaurant advertising that was brandless. This created an affect where their answers are more abstract and implementable as the main focus of the ad attitude is towards a bigger and wider canvas of research. This variable also did not include the video impact of the advertisement, this could or could not be an aspect in shaping the attitude and personality of the advertisement as Shopee advertisements would also utilize captivating videos by featuring artists and famous people in their advertisement.

RQ3: Does musical congruity in e-commerce advertisement influence the perceived image of the e-commerce?

The perceived image variable also had the same effect when compared to the Ad Recall and Ad Attitude. A low high amount of p exceeding the accepted amount as well as a mean difference that is so slight that is insignificant. Perceived image was the one independent variable that has the most questions, when compared to the rest of the variables. The five questions revolve around the idea of what was the image of the Shopee as an e-commerce platform. Respondents are exposed upon five questions of different characteristics of what Shopee as an e-commerce might be from five descriptive statements in the questionnaires where respondents can strongly agree with or strongly disagree with. The descriptive statements are whether Shopee as an ecommerce seems exciting, pleasant, relaxing, cool or appealing. This is where the main effects that resulted in the small mean difference and the exceeding p value takes place. The previous research concludes that the perceived image of restaurant
advertising can be molded or changed through the impacts of musical congruity. One major reason is because again restaurant advertising is much more abstract as there are no brands attached to the restaurant rather the music exposure would make the presumption of what the restaurant is as a brand. Shopee on the other hand is not only a brand, but also a very well known one at least when this research was being conducted. In conclusion, the impact of Shopee’s existence and presence in the industry might already create a presumed bias from the respondents as consumers may already know the idea of what Shopee is as an e-commerce and what the musical impacts does before, after they know about Shopee or how much they know about the brand might not be as significant as to if they have no idea about what Shopee is and what they are as a brand. This is also explainable by a research done by (Zeithaml, 1990) as he mentions that a gap would exist between the customer’s expectations of the service to the perception towards the service after experiencing the service itself. Another major factor for Perceived Image is that it can also be shaped by the video of the advertisement, what is being delivered through their advertisement visually can also shape the perceived image of Shopee’s advertisement.

RQ4: Does musical congruity in e-commerce advertisement influence the service quality expectation of the e-commerce?

When compared to the rest of the results, Quality expectation has a p significance amount that is very close to the accepted amount. However, similarly as the rest of the variables the quality expectation variable did not come to a statistical value that is proven to be significant enough to be accountable for an impact result, from both the mean differences and the p value. Quality expectation is a variable that was more targeted when compared to the previous research that was focused upon restaurant advertising. The previous research finds this crucial as a quality expectation towards restaurant advertising is important so consumers can be intrigued to try the restaurant before having an experience of eating there. This is a different case for Shopee, Quality Expectation is a more abstract aspect in terms of e-commerce advertising. Quality may come from the service or even the quality of the products that are listed in the e-commerce. This resulted in a variation of answers in which consumers may settle with the idea or presumption of Shopee as an e-commerce or the quality that comes from the products listed by Shopee. Recalling the research by (Zeithaml, 1990), the gap between the expectation before the service and the perception after will also play a big factor towards shaping the service image as the expectation before might set a standard towards how consumers “grade” the service after experiencing it. In Conclusion, the variable of Quality Expectation through musical congruity may be too subjective and abstract for it to be implemented in e-commerce as a base of the
research. Quality expectation is also a variable that was never mentioned or intended to be applied or delivered through all four advertisements. This might be the main reason for the answers of the respondents being insignificant with the combination of the abstractness and vastness of what Quality Expectation is in the aspect of Shopee as a well known and reliable e-commerce during the research was conducted.

RQ5: Does musical congruity in e-commerce advertisements influence the intention to purchase?

The final variable in the study of musical congruity in this research is the purchase intent. As mentioned on the subchapter before, all the variables own a mean amount and a significance point that is too minimal for it to be classified as a significant impact. This is indifferent for the case of Purchase Intent as a variable in this research as well. The previous research targeted the Purchase Intent musical congruity factor through restaurant advertising as a method of finding whether there are any music or soundscapes that may enhance a consumer’s intent towards purchasing the products sold in the restaurant. In other words, the research aims to find the effect of music to an individual’s perception and whether the targeted music may or may not create an impact in their intuition towards their intent on eating at the restaurant. This is not so far from what this research is trying to gain as well, Purchase Intent may be one of or if not the most crucial aspect in the longevity of an e-commerce platform. Therefore, utilizing an advertisement to its maximum potential and in this case with the assistance of music is crucial and necessary for e-commerce platforms to start taking into account. However in the case of Shopee, the presence and existence of the platform in Indonesia has already been visible and prominent, (Ruswanti, 2015) mentions that a positive experience to a brand will result into a sense of comfort and also confidence for consumers to re-purchase the product/service even with a higher price, this might be the case for this pre-assumed bias towards Shopee as most respondents are already users of Shopee and that they already have a high intent of using the service in their daily lives. As mentioned in the first chapter, Shopee has dominated the market and are in the top three most used e-commerce platforms in Indonesia, they have been and were one of the pioneers of a successful e-commerce platform. What this does to this research is that there is a clear line of biasness again as there were on the previous variables. Most of the respondents are also users in Shopee, they have used the platform multiple times and have created a sense of trust towards the platform. Therefore, the advertisements that have been exposed to the respondents might not be created to drive the intention to purchase but rather to remind the existing users to continue to purchase and utilize the platform as a space for online
shopping. The respondents are also exposed to a more knowable form of service, this is completely different towards the restaurant advertising as both services are very far apart from one to another. E-commerce platforms and especially the dominant ones own a different set of consumer perception which affects the purchase intent variable. Meanwhile, the restaurant advertising that was discussed in the previous research has a space that is more narrow as the restaurant business is competitive and the intention of eating in one restaurant isn't comparable to an individual’s intent towards shopping in a certain e-commerce platform, in this case Shopee.

5.2 Managerial implications

When we analyze the competitive market today, both in a business standpoint as well as through the general public’s perception towards services that operate in today’s evolving commercial market, there is no denying that businesses have to be more creative as well as focused upon the aspect of advertising by creating the biggest impact through a small and short limited amount of time. The online platform is filled with multiple information and advertisements that constantly and continuously swarm consumers and potential consumer’s minds in a competitive manner. The utilization of music through advertising has been not only powerful but also crucial for the development of an effective and efficient tool to deliver an advertising message. However, the utilization of music in advertising is truly an abstract and vast stimulus for it to be proven to be successful and impactful. Therefore, there are several points and remarks that should be a considerable factor when companies or businesses want to apply music in their advertisement, the points that can be considered from this research are:

Congruent music works best with recall and attitude of ad

As seen from the results of the 2 way ANOVA, there is a significant difference when it comes to the impact of congruent music towards the respondents. This is visible through the mean results as well as the interactions from one musical congruity to another. When it comes to the meaning of the results statistically, it shows that the first two variables are dominated by the effects of congruent music. Congruent music means that it has a high sense of relevancy as well as a high sense of expectancy. In Shopee’s case it is the Shopee Baby Shark. The song itself has proven its presence and recallability even before it was altered for Shopee and as it was utilized by Shopee to deliver their advertising
message, it created the expected impact as the song resonates the highest around the four musical congruity groups. It shows that it is recallable and creates a strong bond in the memories of the respondents as the song isn’t foreign to the listeners and that the tunes of the song are very repetitive making it easy to remember. The song also resulted in the highest sense of attitude towards the ad, in other words the Baby Shark anthem causes a sense of assumption towards the branding of the brand. This is where respondents feel that the brand is cool, appealing or good in general as the image of the brand. IN conclusion when it comes to the impact of recallability as well as the branding aspects of Shopee’s case, the Shopee Baby Shark song works the best for such impacts. In other words, Congruent music works best for Shopee’s musical advertising

**Music in visual advertising is complimentary for the effectiveness of delivering the ad message**

Another factor that is visible through all four musical congruity groups is the fact that the advertisements are delivered through a visual video as well where the music is a secondary stimulus in the advertisement. Shopee Baby Shark is paired with a video of Cristiano Ronaldo dancing to the song, Shopee COD is paired with a video of Tukul Arwana dancing in the video, Shopee Barokah is paired with a muslim actress singing in the video and finally Shopee Midnight MANTUL sale is paired with a moving graphic video that featured Amanda Manopo in the video. What can be gathered from this is that the musical congruity advertising stimulus should also be paired with an intriguing visual stimulus. The featuring of the famous artists in the video can also be a factor that creates a difference to the intriguing effect of an advertisement. As mentioned before, the platform that is constantly used by Shopee to spread the advertising message is a video based platform called Youtube. Therefore, there is no denying that there is a correlation between the utilization of music through advertisements with the pairing and enhancement through an intriguing visual stimulus such as a video. The correlations are not discussed in this research but the implementation and delivery of the advertising music that is spread upon platforms such as Youtube has always been paired with a visual stimulus. In conclusion, as effective as an advertisement music could be there is still a need for businesses to utilize other different stimulus and for example visual stimulus as a form to further increase the effectiveness of an advertisement.

**Severely Incongruent music serves best in delivery of information**
As seen from the results of the 2 way ANOVA, there is a significant difference when it comes to the impact of severely incongruent music towards the respondents. Again, this is visible through the mean results as well as the interactions from one musical congruity to another. When it comes to the meaning of the results statistically, it shows that the last final three variables are dominated by the effects of severely incongruent music. Severely incongruent music means that it has a low sense of relevancy as well as a low sense of expectancy. In Shopee’s case it is the Shopee Midnight MANTUL Sale music. The song itself has never been heard before by anyone before the existence of it as a background dubbing music in Shopee’s Midnight MANTUL Sale advertisement as it was made by the Shopee itself. The song was not intended to be trendy nor “fun” as the song was only for a background music for the advertising message to be delivered. Therefore, the song will only play as a background music while the message is delivered narratively with no tunes or melodies whatsoever. However, this sort of music was working the best as it does not interfere with the informational values that is delivered through the advertisement. This is seen on the third, fourth and fifth song that has a personality that is informational and less on the branding side as it was for the first two songs. In conclusion when it comes to the impact of the best type of music to deliver an informational based advertisement, severely incongruent music may be the right choice to be utilized and in this case it was the Shopee Midnight MANTUL music.

**Implementation of music in advertisements depends on the brand and presence of the business**

Through Chapter 4 we have found that there is a small significance through the p value as well as the slight difference of the mean. This was visible through all the variables which are Ad Recall, Ad Attitude, Perceived Image, Quality Expectation and Purchase Intent that was tested with the 2 Way ANOVA. One explanation that we can conclude from this was that the presence of Shopee and the fact of how well known the platform has created a presumed idea of what the brand is. In other words, it is difficult to find the pure effect of the music through a brand that has already own a presumed idea of what it stands for in the minds of the respondents. What we can take out of this is the fact that a chosen music for an advertisement needs to be able to fit itself with the type of brand and the overall presence of a brand. If the tunes of Shopee Baby Shark are recycled to be used for a different e-commerce that might not have the same exposure as Shopee, there will definitely be a difference towards how the respondents would react. Unfortunately for this research, the music impact is covered through the existing assumption of what respondents think about Shopee as the brand has already successfully captured a huge amount of following and the presence of the brand has been undeniably prominent. Therefore, the purest effect of the music is covered by Shopee itself as a brand. In conclusion, when a
brand wants to utilize musical advertising, they first need to know who they are as a brand and how the music is going to be implemented in their advertisement. If a brand has already created a good amount of exposure and following perhaps the utilization of any type of music will still create an impact rather than when a brand is still in development of creating a following. Just like in the previous research, they were able to experiment the impacts of the music considering the brand is a fictional brand without any sort of following creating a cleaner canvas towards what sort of impact can music generate off of the advertisement.

5.3 Research Limitation

This research encountered several limitations that have created an impact and affected the result. These are the results listed below:

1. Research that is only focused upon one platform

This research is only focused upon one platform, therefore there are many aspects that are limited due to the narrow base of research. Considering the base focus of this research is Shopee, the problem of the bias of the respondents cannot be set aside as there are no other e-commerce that this research can compare to. This resulted towards multiple variables being constrained into the space of the platform, and in this case a platform that is too prominent and dominant to fully have clarity to the impact of the stimulus towards the variable. Meanwhile if this research was to study different e-commerce platforms, different results can be useful for comparisons of one variable to another.
2. An Experimental condition that is from an online platform

This research was conducted through a method of online surveys to improve the practicality and the duration of conducting the research. The previous research was conducted through a face to face method where each respondent would sit and listen to the advertisement. What this does is that it creates a more intimate and honest atmosphere about how the respondents feel about the music. Online surveys on the other hand are more practical but it does not necessarily create an honest and realistic result. Respondents may simply fill up the questionnaire to finish the survey as quickly as possible.

3. Variables that aren't fully supportive with the research

The variable used in this research is exactly the same as the previous conducted. However, the previous research’s focus was towards restaurant advertising. Not every variable in advertising a restaurant could be compatible and also supportive for it to be implemented towards a research that is focused upon online e-commerce platforms even if they study the same factor which is musical congruity. For example, the Quality Expectation and Perceived image is perhaps a variable that is more fitted upon the restaurant aspect rather than the e-commerce aspect.

4. Musical Congruity creates different impacts through the advertisements

Through the research we can find that there are different impacts of musical congruity in Shopee’s advertisements. Although slight and insignificant, it is interesting to see that there are different effects of the musical congruity group in Shopee’s musical advertisements through the independent variables. As mentioned before, Congruent music works best to enhance Shopee’s brand image and Shopee’s ad recall. While severely incongruent music works best for the service side of advertising which are the variables of Quality expectation, Perceived image and Purchase Intent.
5.4 Research Recommendation

1. Respondents that are less loyal to the exposure of Shopee

The respondents that are in this research are mostly exposed to the presence and exposure of Shopee. This resulted in a slightly biased answer from the respondents as they already have a presumption of what Shopee is as a service in their mind. If there is a chance for future research upon this topic, perhaps respondents who aren't aware of this e-commerce platform are much more considerate rather than those who have known and experienced this platform. This is challenging for this research as it is conducted in Indonesia, where most of the people have already either used or at least are aware of this platform as mentioned in the first chapter. If this research was conducted perhaps in a different country where Shopee hasn’t penetrated the market, it would be much more clear of the effects of music as the respondents may be less biased about the effects of the advertisement.

2. A smaller or developing E-commerce platform

As mentioned before, the people of Indonesia have been aware of the presence of Shopee and most of them have used the platform to ease their shopping needs. If a future researcher would want to study musical congruity through the advertisement of an e-commerce platform in Indonesia, it would be better for the research to use a smaller or a lesser known platform other than Shopee. This would create the same impact as the first statement above, a lesser biased answer as respondents are not aware of the platform yet making the respondents unexposed from the platform with hopes that it would result in their answer being more diverse and informational upon the impact of the musical congruity in the advertising of e-commerce platform. An E-commerce platform that is too prominent. This research utilized Shopee as the base study for the musical congruity that is delivered through the questionnaires to 160 respondents. Shopee on the other hand is a well known e-commerce service that has already dominated the Indonesian market. What this does is that respondents are already aware of the existence and the presence of the reputation of Shopee. This is not supportive for the research as a smaller and less exposed e-commerce platform would result in a less biased reaction from the respondents towards the variables and musical advertisement.
3. An Experimental research method that is face to face

When we take into account the executional aspect of this research, it is notable that the research prioritizes practicality as well as the limited time that the researcher has to fully run the experiment. This is the main reason for the adoption of online surveys as a method of spreading the questionnaire to the 160 respondents. Online surveys on the other hand, have been used multiple times by different researchers in this current moment considering the impact of COVID-19. Through an experimental research perspective, it may create an impact on how fully committed the respondents are in completing the survey. As mentioned before, the previous research conducted a face to face method of gathering the answers from the respondents, this might be more effective as the atmosphere and the environment of the research is more intimate which may encourage honesty where the respondents can be more detailed upon answering the questions as well as a more sense of focus in listening when being exposed with the advertising music.

4. Variables that are supportive for the research

The previous research formulated five different independent variables as a method to study the effect of musical congruity towards restaurant advertising. With the adoption of the same variables from the previous research to be applied to this research, a lot of the variables are too subjective to be a pillar of research in this study. If a future research would utilize variables that are more supportive for an e-commerce study, the result of the musical congruity would be more detailed and narrow to fully understand the musical congruity impact. Quality expectation for example, can be replaced with service expectation to better find the detailed understanding of how musical congruity through advertisements can affect the expectation of a consumer towards the service that they have not tried. Other variables can also be implemented to better fit the category of the e-commerce aspect.
5.5 Conclusion

Through this research the results of musical congruity in ecommerce advertising has been proven to be more abstract than it was estimated for it to be. Musical congruity is a dependent variable that is still in development for it to be concluded into a single theoretical formula. In other words, the impacts and effects of musical congruity is dependent on the “canvas” of the study. For example, there is a clear difference towards how it impacted this research when compared to the previous research regarding the restaurant advertising.

When musical congruity is placed into a business whether product or service that is still under development, the chances of the musical congruity to create an impact or effect would be bigger and more significant rather than a business that has already own a powerful brand name such as Shopee. Musical congruity can mold, shape or create a perception to a consumer’s mind in a limited manner. It cannot be the most essential aspect to creating an impactful advertisement but it is also a factor that shouldn't be underestimated. From the study of Shopee’s case, we can conclude the fact that Shopee is too big for a brand for musical congruity to truly take place and for this research to measure its clearest influence. Most of the respondents who are exposed to the advertisements are already aware of the brand and its characteristics making the results insignificant as they would consider the brand’s advertisement to already be powerful enough to deliver its message. This is clearly visible through the consistent results of a high mean through all the variables from Ad Recall to Purchase Intent. All the musical congruity groups also do not create a clear line of differences through the results of the study. What can be concluded is that to measure and see the full effectivity of musical congruity, a researcher has to also take into account the variables that are to be measured. This can be achieved by looking at the characteristics of a brand and how it has performed as a business. Through this research, we can also conclude that different businesses whether product or service would need a measurement for its own when trying to see the full effect of musical congruity.

Finally, this research can also be beneficial for future experimental studies regarding musical congruity in the world of advertising. Musical congruity is bigger and vaster than simply the idea of “putting music into an advertisement”, it requires an unbiased canvas of study or as mentioned before a brand that hasn't fully developed its perception in the eyes of the consumers. It also requires respondents who are unbiased upon the idea of what the brand is, supporting the statement before regarding a developing brand. It is also essential for the experimental research method to be more honest or perhaps “real” in the process of gathering the answers for a questionnaire as online surveys
may create results that are practical but flawed through how un-captivating the process could be for the respondents.

Lastly, this research found that although the abstractness of musical congruity can be complicated, the utilization of it in the world of advertising would be a big mistake for it to be taken lightly or underestimated. More and more companies have utilized this method as a tool to deliver their advertising message, it does not only come from big companies who would have the audience and could afford the risk of utilizing music but it is universal for any businesses to adopt this method of delivering an advertising message. The presence of music itself is debatably an essential part of human existence, it provokes emotions and bring beauty to the existence of humans as a species and whether a commercial can be annoying to listen to, the fact that sound itself exist in a commercial is evidence that the audio sensory aspect of human beings can be utilized to an extent as a tool to communicate through, and music might be the best way or one of the best way to communicate through it.